

**IN THE MATTER OF THE THOMAS R. BRAIDWOOD, Q.C.,
COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY UNDER THE *PUBLIC INQUIRY ACT*,
SBC 2007, c. 9**

Room 801
Federal Courthouse
701 West Georgia Street
Vancouver, B.C.

February 19, 2009

PROCEEDINGS AT
HEARING (DAY 20)

COPY

McEachern & Associates
2390 Kensington Avenue
Burnaby, B.C. V5B 4E2
Phone: (604) 299-3595; Fax: (604) 299-3545
Toll-free: 1-866-366-2202

**IN THE MATTER OF THE THOMAS R. BRAIDWOOD, Q.C.,
COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY UNDER THE *PUBLIC INQUIRY ACT*,
SBC 2007, c. 9**

Room 801
Federal Courthouse
701 West Georgia Street
Vancouver, B.C.

February 19, 2009

PROCEEDINGS AT
HEARING (DAY 20)

Commissioner:	T.R. Braidwood, Q.C.
Commission Counsel:	A. Vertlieb, Q.C.
Associate Commission Counsel:	P. McGowan
Counsel for Zofia Cisowski:	W. Kosteckyj, S. Whiteley, S. Parhar

(ii)

Counsel for Government of Canada:	J. Brongers, H. Roberts
Counsel for Vancouver Airport Authority:	D. Stewart, C. Friesen, B. Ergun
Counsel for B.C. Civil Liberties Association:	G. Pastine, S. Dubinsky
Counsel for Government of Poland:	D. Rosenbloom
Counsel for Corporal Benjamin Robinson:	R. Harris
Counsel for Constable Gerry Rundel:	T. Beaubier
Counsel for Constable Bill Bentley:	D. Butcher
Counsel for Constable Kwesi Millington:	R. Hira, Q.C.
Counsel for Public Service Alliance of Canada:	C. Buchanan, B. Matthews
Counsel for City of Richmond:	J. Goulden, M. Kleisinger, G. Trotter
Counsel for TASER International, Inc.	D. Neave, J. Spencer
Registrar:	L.N. Giles
Court Recorder:	P. Kealy, C.V.R., C.M.
Transcriber:	D. Rochfort

1
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

Vancouver, B.C.
February 19, 2009

1
2
3
4 THE REGISTRAR: The hearing is now resumed.

5 MR. MCGOWAN: Good morning, Mr. Commissioner. This
6 morning's first witness is a Ms. Sandi Greenfield
7 -- first and only witness.

8 Ms. Greenfield, please come forward. You see
9 there's the box right over there. Thank you,
10 ma'am.

11 THE REGISTRAR: Good morning.

12 MS. GREENFIELD: Good morning.

13 THE REGISTRAR: Before you're seated, do you wish to be
14 sworn or affirmed? Sworn is on the Bible and
15 affirmed is not.

16 MS. GREENFIELD: Sworn is fine.

17 THE REGISTRAR: Sworn? Would you please your right
18 hand on the Bible, please.

19
20 SANDI GREENFIELD, a witness,
21 sworn.
22

23 THE REGISTRAR: Would you state your full name, please?

24 A Sandi -- or Sandra M. Greenfield.

25 THE REGISTRAR: Anne, A-n-n-e? Anne is your middle
26 name, did you say?

27 A Marie.

28 THE REGISTRAR: Oh, Marie, I'm sorry. And would you
29 spell your surname, please?

30 A Greenfield. G-r-e-e-n-f-i-e-l-d.

31 THE REGISTRAR: Thank you. You may be seated.
32 Counsel.
33

34 EXAMINATION IN CHIEF BY MR. MCGOWAN:
35

36 Q Ms. Greenfield, I understand you're employed by E-
37 Comm.

38 A That's correct.

39 Q You've been employed by them since 1999?

40 A Yes.

41 Q Could you tell the Commissioner what your position
42 is?

43 A I'm Voice Records Coordinator at E-Comm.

44 Q Okay. And what does the Voice Records Coordinator
45 do?

46 A I retrieve audio for investigative and evidentiary
47 purposes.

2
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Q So I take it your role brings you in contact with
2 police forces and in fact the court fairly
3 frequently.
4 A Yes.
5 Q Okay. Now, I wonder if you could just take a
6 moment and explain to the Commissioner who E-Comm
7 is and what they do.
8 A E-Comm is an amalgamated dispatch centre. We
9 dispatch for various police and fire agencies
10 throughout the Lower Mainland.
11 Q Now, if I understand correctly, E-Comm provides
12 the 9-1-1 answering service for all of Metro
13 Vancouver.
14 A That's correct.
15 Q So if somebody dials 9-1-1, they'll get a person
16 who picks up the phone, they say, "Police, Fire,
17 Ambulance," that's somebody at E-Comm.
18 A Yes, it is.
19 Q And in addition to providing the 9-1-1 answering
20 service for Metro Vancouver, E-Comm also provides
21 dispatch service for various agencies.
22 A Correct.
23 Q And the dispatch service, if I understand
24 correctly, doesn't apply to all agencies, but only
25 those that have contracted on an individual basis
26 with E-Comm.
27 A That's correct.
28 Q Okay. And with respect to the incident we're
29 going to be speaking of, Richmond RCMP has their
30 dispatch done through E-Comm?
31 A Yes, they do.
32 Q And Richmond Fire has their dispatch done through
33 E-Comm?
34 A Yes.
35 Q Okay. And what about the B.C. Ambulance Service?
36 A No, we do not dispatch for B.C. Ambulance Service.
37 Q Okay. Let's talk, first of all, about agencies
38 who you do do dispatch for. Take a moment and
39 explain to the Commissioner the route that a call
40 takes when it comes in right down through the
41 ultimate dispatch to the agency.
42 A Using this incident as an example?
43 Q Just speaking generally.
44 A Okay. Someone dials 9-1-1, it comes through to
45 what we call our 9-1-1 queue. The 9-1-1 operator
46 asks whether they need police, ambulance or fire,
47 and based on their answer, if they say they need

3
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 the police department, "For what jurisdiction?"
2 They say, "Richmond RCMP." Then the call gets
3 transferred through to the Richmond RCMP. If it's
4 for another agency that we do not dispatch for,
5 such as Burnaby RCMP, the call would be
6 transferred out of E-Comm to the Burnaby RCMP.
7 Q Okay. So for Richmond RCMP, for example, you have
8 a 9-1-1 call person who takes the call. When you
9 say they transfer it to Richmond RCMP, it's
10 actually just transferred to a different room at
11 the same location to another E-Comm operator.
12 A That's correct.
13 Q And that E-Comm operator will ultimately dispatch
14 the call to the appropriate agency.
15 A No, that -- that operator will create a call for
16 dispatch on our computer-aided dispatch system and
17 that computer-aided dispatch ticket, per se, gets
18 sent to the dispatcher. The dispatcher then
19 dispatches it out to the members.
20 Q Okay. So the computer-aided dispatch, is that
21 sometimes called the CAD?
22 A That's correct.
23 Q And in the case of a police dispatch with Richmond
24 RCMP, that would actually result in a -- something
25 which comes up on the screen of the police
26 vehicle.
27 A That's correct.
28 Q Okay. With certain information about the call?
29 A Yes.
30 Q Okay. And the dispatcher, I take it, would also
31 make a radio call to the Richmond RCMP or the
32 appropriate detachment to dispatch the call.
33 A That's correct.
34 Q Okay. Now -- and the same -- does the same apply
35 for Richmond Fire? There would be some sort of a
36 CAD generated?
37 A Yes.
38 Q And there would also be a radio call?
39 A Yes.
40 Q Okay. Now, what's the case with B.C. Ambulance?
41 How does that work if somebody calls in for --
42 asking for an ambulance?
43 A The call gets transferred to B.C. Ambulance
44 Service which is not housed in E-Comm, and their
45 call-takers would assess the call, create a call
46 for dispatch and then pretty much the same, going
47 to a dispatcher to dispatch out to the members.

4
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Q Okay. So you don't do the dispatch at all for
2 B.C. Ambulance. You simply transfer the call to
3 them, they have their own system.
4 A That's correct.
5 Q Now, if I understand correctly, you have certain
6 guidelines or goals that E-Comm is supposed to --
7 to go -- and maybe I'll just run through those and
8 see if you can agree. If I understand there's --
9 the general goal is 95 percent of calls should be
10 answered by the initial operator in five seconds,
11 and -- is that your understanding?
12 A That's -- yes.
13 Q And there's also a goal that 90 percent of the
14 calls should be filtered down to the dispatch
15 operator within ten seconds?
16 A Correct.
17 Q Okay. And those standards aren't always -- the
18 five seconds and ten seconds aren't met with every
19 call, but generally you try to meet them with 95
20 and 90 percent of calls respectively.
21 A I can't answer that myself.
22 Q Okay. Fair enough. You know what the guidelines
23 are, but you don't know what the compliance is.
24 A I don't know what the results are.
25 Q Okay. Fair enough. Now, tell the Commissioner,
26 if you would, what procedures are in place or
27 equipment is in place to record calls to 9-1-1.
28 A We have digital recording loggers that record
29 every 9-1-1 call that comes through to E-Comm as
30 well as loggers that record all the phone lines
31 for the radios and the dispatchers' phones.
32 Q Okay. And are those recordings logged or archived
33 in any way?
34 A Yes. The recordings are archived to a data
35 archive tape every ten minutes as a redundant -- a
36 redundancy.
37 Q And they're maintained well past the time of the
38 call?
39 A Oh, yes. The recordings on a -- on our phone
40 logger can remain on that logger without being
41 rewritten over for at least three months now.
42 Q Okay. Now, I take it at some point you were asked
43 to undertake a search with respect to the incident
44 we've come to know involves Mr. Dziekanski and the
45 Richmond RCMP.
46 A Yes.
47 Q Okay. Tell the Commissioner about what you were

5
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 asked to do and the process you undertook to
2 uncover recordings relevant to this matter.
3 A Okay. I was asked to locate all the calls -- all
4 the calls associated and the radio transmissions
5 associated to this incident. As a result, I was
6 given the CAD event number. Based on the
7 information I was able to obtain from the CAD
8 event, I started my search with a time parameter.
9 Searched for -- my initial search was for any
10 calls that came through to the Richmond RCMP.
11 Q Mm-hmm.
12 A Going through the calls that were received by the
13 Richmond RCMP, I was unable to locate any -- in my
14 initial investigation, I was unable to locate any
15 outside calls. The one call that I did locate
16 relating to this incident came from YVR Ops
17 through a direct line to the dispatcher. The
18 dispatcher created a call for dispatch and, as a
19 result, I followed through on the radio
20 transmissions relating to the incident.
21 Q Okay. So initially you went through and you
22 gathered every call you could involving the
23 Richmond RCMP. I take it you also did that for
24 Richmond Fire?
25 A Richmond Fire, as far as I was aware, there were
26 no calls from the public for -- on Genesis.
27 Q I'm sorry, calls between E-Comm and Richmond Fire.
28 A Yes.
29 Q Okay. So you --
30 A That was on a separate investigation.
31 Q Okay. So you had one investigation related to any
32 calls to E-Comm relating to this incident from the
33 outside.
34 A Yes.
35 Q You also attempted to locate recordings between E-
36 Comm and the Richmond RCMP or between Richmond
37 dispatch and the Richmond RCMP?
38 A Yes.
39 Q You did the same for calls between Richmond
40 dispatch -- between your dispatcher and the
41 Richmond firefighters?
42 A Yes.
43 Q You also -- okay. And in your initial
44 investigation, you found a reporting of the
45 incident directly from the airport?
46 A Yes.
47 Q And that -- we've come to know that came from a

6
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Ms. Hanson at the airport. And you've
2 subsequently, I understand, taken a further --
3 undertaken a further investigation and found some
4 additional calls to 9-1-1 from members of the
5 public apparently about this incident.
6 A Yes.
7 Q And those haven't yet been provided, but you have
8 them here today?
9 A Yes.
10 Q And I understand that you have also some documents
11 related to this including some computer printouts,
12 CAD reports and transcripts.
13 A Yes, those were the documents that I used to
14 obtain the audio.
15 MR. MCGOWAN: Now, Mr. Commission, Ms. Greenfield has
16 these and she's tentatively given copies to
17 counsel for the Commission. Her understanding is
18 that they're the property of the RCMP and doesn't
19 feel comfortable providing them to us on any
20 official basis or having them entered without a
21 direction by the Commissioner. I've spoken with
22 my friend from the RCMP. I understand they don't
23 have a problem with that procedure.
24 THE COMMISSIONER: I'm very much appreciative of that.
25 All right, go ahead.
26 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. Thank you. Now, perhaps just so
27 we can hand copies out to everyone, Mr.
28 Commissioner, you could make a direction that she
29 provide us with the relevant material she has and
30 also a copy of the CD to the Commission to be
31 ultimately entered as an exhibit.
32 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I make that direction.
33 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you. I'm just having Ms. McKeachie
34 now provide copies of some of these documents,
35 which have been provided to us, to the other
36 counsel. A couple of these may have been
37 distributed earlier, but some of them are new to
38 the Commission.
39 Q Ma'am, I'm going to place one document in front of
40 you. I need -- if I might just have a moment.
41 MR. MCGOWAN: I'm just going to have a couple of
42 additional copies made.
43 Q Now, the first document I place in front of you,
44 ma'am, is that a log of the calls you initially
45 located during your search?
46 A Yes, it is.
47 Q Okay. And it's got some information about the

7
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 start time and stop time as well as a name of the
2 title that's been given to the call?

3 A Yes.

4 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. There's going to be a number of
5 documents, Mr. Commissioner. I don't know if you
6 want to have them as one exhibit and labelled or
7 subsequent exhibits.

8 THE COMMISSIONER: Yeah, I think we can just have one
9 exhibit here.

10 MR. MCGOWAN: Perhaps that'll be A, then.

11 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. What number are we at here,
12 Mr. Giles?

13 THE REGISTRAR: Exhibit A, you say? Did you want this
14 for identification or are you just --

15 MR. MCGOWAN: No, whatever the next number is with the
16 letter A designation following it.

17 THE REGISTRAR: Well, it would be Exhibit number 40.

18 MR. MCGOWAN: So let's call this 40A.

19 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, 40A.

20 THE REGISTRAR: So you'll have no 40 then.

21 THE COMMISSIONER: That's correct.

22 MR. MCGOWAN: There'll be no 40. We'll have 40A and
23 then we'll -- if that's -- if the Commissioner is
24 content with that.

25 THE COMMISSIONER: No, I'm content with that because
26 there's many of these.

27 MR. MCGOWAN: There will be a number of these
28 documents, yes.

29

30 EXHIBIT 40A: Voice records spreadsheet
31 created on October 15, 2007
32

33 MR. MCGOWAN:

34 Q Now, I understand that there's been a transcript
35 of these created and we'll have that to file
36 momentarily. Additionally, I'll place a copy of
37 that before you. Is this a transcript of the
38 calls that were noted on your initial sheet
39 generated from your search?

40 A On A, item A?

41 Q Item B, the next thing I just handed you. Yeah,
42 is that a transcript of the calls listed on item
43 A?

44 A Yes, it is. It's not necessarily in full order.

45 Q That's fine. We'll deal with the order in a
46 minute.

47 Now, the next thing I've got is a -- what I

8
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 understand to be the CAD report which was
2 generated from the dispatch to the Richmond RCMP.
3 I'm going to place a copy of that before you.
4 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, should we mark this as --
5 MR. McGOWAN: Sorry, the transcript --
6 THE COMMISSIONER: -- 40B?
7 MR. McGOWAN: -- perhaps should be B.
8 THE COMMISSIONER: Yeah, 40B.
9 THE REGISTRAR: That will be marked as 40B.
10
11 EXHIBIT 40B: Transcripts of radio
12 transmissions and phone calls by File LM07-
13 368T4
14
15 MR. McGOWAN: If that could be placed before the
16 witness, that exhibit, Mr. Registrar, the one I
17 just handed you. I don't have another copy as of
18 yet.
19 Q Now, ma'am, this is -- I'm going to ask you a few
20 questions about this while we've got it in front
21 of you. This is the computer-generated printout
22 that relates to the RCMP dispatch to this
23 incident?
24 A Yes, it is.
25 Q Okay. It's known as a CAD?
26 A Yes.
27 Q Okay. We see at the top there's some times that
28 are entered. The first appears to be "Received";
29 is that right? Is that an abbreviation for
30 received?
31 A Yes.
32 Q 1:23. And is that the time that the call is
33 received according to the E-Comm timer?
34 A Yes.
35 Q Okay. Okay, and that's --
36 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's C.
37 MR. McGOWAN:
38 Q That's 1:23, and have you ultimately determined
39 that there's a bit of a time lag between this and
40 some other timing devices?
41 A Yes, I noticed that the -- there is a time
42 discrepancy between the -- what we call the CAD
43 and our voice loggers.
44 MR. McGOWAN: Okay. And maybe just for the assistance
45 of my friend, I'm looking at a page that says at
46 the top, "Mainland Municipal Department,
47 JURISDICTION - RICHMOND RCMP". It's got some

9
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 times listed close to the top, the first one being
2 1:23, Sunday October 14th.

3 THE REGISTRAR: And that's a document to be marked as
4 B, 40B?

5 MR. MCGOWAN: No, this will be the document to be --
6 the next one to be marked as C. The transcript
7 was B.

8 THE REGISTRAR: Okay. This will be marked as 40C,
9 then.

10 MR. MCGOWAN: Yes, with the Commissioner's leave.

11 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

12

13 EXHIBIT 40C: Richmond RCMP transmissions log
14 for E1537

15

16 MR. MCGOWAN:

17 Q Okay. So there's a time counter that is
18 associated with the voice recordings, correct?

19 A Yes.

20 Q And you noticed that there's a discrepancy you've
21 -- which you've discerned between that time
22 counter and the one which generates the times on
23 this printout.

24 A Yes.

25 Q And I wonder if you could tell the Commissioner,
26 if you're able, what the discrepancy was.

27 A The discrepancy is about one minute and 30
28 seconds. You'll see where it says "Time: Recd"
29 1:23," on the CAD event, and the recording itself
30 did not start till 1:24:46.

31 Q Okay. So there's about a minute and 30 seconds --

32 A Where it shows --

33 Q The time counter is later by a minute on -- the
34 voice recording is about a minute and 30 seconds
35 later in time.

36 A That's correct.

37 Q Okay. So the call is received at 1:23. That's --
38 is that the time that it actually rings through to
39 E-Comm?

40 A That's the time that it presented -- the phone
41 number presented itself or the phone call
42 presented itself to the dispatcher.

43 Q Okay.

44 A Or to the call taker.

45 THE COMMISSIONER: Are we assuming that the base time
46 is the correct time?

47 MR. MCGOWAN: I'm not proceeding on that assumption.

10
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 I'm proceeding -- it's the time that is --
2 THE COMMISSIONER: All right.
3 MR. MCGOWAN: The time that is noted here. So
4 according to that counter, it's 1:23.
5 THE COMMISSIONER: All right.
6 MR. MCGOWAN:
7 Q Do you -- you don't know which clock is correct, I
8 take it.
9 A It's -- it's difficult to say which clock is
10 correct. What happens is the -- the voice loggers
11 themselves have to be manually set or time-sync'd.
12 Q Yes.
13 A Because it doesn't go out to the internet to grab
14 the time for Greenwich Mean Time.
15 Q Okay.
16 A Where our CAD events are sync'd with Greenwich
17 Mean Time. The loggers, in order to set it, have
18 to be shut down, manually set the time, and then
19 it's the length of time it takes to reboot up that
20 causes the time discrepancy.
21 Q Okay. Do I understand that the times noted on
22 this document, 40C, are computer-sync'd with
23 Greenwich Mean Time?
24 A To the best of my knowledge, yes.
25 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. That's the base.
26 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. Fair enough.
27 Q So it comes in at 1:23 according to this document
28 which you understand to be sync'd with Greenwich
29 Mean Time, and then it says, "Queued: 1:25."
30 What does that mean?
31 A That the queued time is from the time that the
32 call-taker created the transmit button to create
33 the call and send it to the dispatcher.
34 Q So that's the time it goes from the 9-1-1 call
35 answer person to the person who does dispatch for
36 the Richmond RCMP at E-Comm.
37 A Yeah, the length of time it took to obtain the
38 information, type the information in, and when
39 they hit "transmit", and then that actually
40 creates the call.
41 Q And then the time -- "Disp", does that stand for
42 dispatch?
43 A Yes.
44 Q And what time is that?
45 A 1:25.
46 Q Yes, and what -- is that the time that the
47 information is sent to the Richmond RCMP?

11
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A That's -- yes, to the members.
2 Q Both by way of a computer-generated screen that's
3 sent, and by way of a voice --
4 A Verbal, yeah.
5 Q -- voice information over the radio?
6 A Yes.
7 Q Okay. The next time "Enroute", how is that time
8 generated?
9 A Based on what I'm seeing here, it could be two
10 possible ways. What I'm -- what I'm seeing here
11 is that the dispatcher placed the officer en route
12 at the same time as she was dispatching him.
13 Q Okay. So that's a -- that time is entered or
14 keyed in by the dispatcher?
15 A Yeah. The only other way that it could happen is
16 if the member was in his car and he'd hit his en
17 route button.
18 Q Okay. Now, we have -- the next is "OS". Is that
19 on scene?
20 A Yes.
21 Q And how is that time entered?
22 A Entered by the dispatcher.
23 Q Okay. And is that usually in response to a radio
24 call by the member?
25 A Yes.
26 Q Okay. Can it be done from the vehicle?
27 A Yes.
28 Q Okay. So the other possibility is the member hit
29 a button in the vehicle which generated this time
30 stamp.
31 A Yeah, but that's not the case in this one.
32 Q Okay. You can tell that because -- by looking at
33 the computer printout?
34 A Yeah, by reading the computer printout.
35 Q Okay, fair enough. And "Cleared", that's -- was
36 this actually cleared by Officer Millington from
37 his car or is that another situation where the
38 officers phoned in?
39 A That shows as being cleared by the member on -- on
40 the car terminal.
41 Q Okay, and we see that because it's got "By:" and
42 then the officers name with some numbers after it.
43 A Yes.
44 Q Okay. Fair enough. Now, we have below some
45 writing:
46
47 Intox 55yr old male in International Arrivals

12
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 in reception lobby throwing luggage around //
2 non-white, drk hair white coat as per Ops //
3 no other details avail (sic).
4

5 Is this information typed in by the Richmond
6 dispatcher or the 9-1-1 operator?

7 A By the -- by the 9-1-1 -- or by the Richmond call-
8 taker.

9 Q Richmond call-taker, okay. And is this the
10 information that would have shown up on the
11 computer screen in the police vehicle?

12 A Yes.

13 Q Okay. And is it also the information -- well, I
14 guess we'll hear what was said over the radio.
15 That's recorded, correct?

16 A Yes.

17 Q All right. Now, under the heading "Additional
18 Remarks", we have some additional information. It
19 says: "UPDT", is that update?

20 A Yes.

21 Q

22 Male is now throwing chairs thru glass
23 windows in that area.
24

25 A Correct.

26 Q Is that information that would have shown up on
27 the computer screen?

28 A Yes.

29 Q Okay. And do we know what time it would have
30 shown up on the computer screen?

31 A It says 1:27 on here.

32 Q Okay. And we'll hear, I guess, whether that was
33 transmitted by radio as well. If it was, that
34 would be recorded?

35 A Yes.

36 Q Okay. And finally, we have a note at the end. It
37 says:

38

39 And that there was somebody who may have the
40 incident on video. His name is Loren
41 Meltzer...message left with primary member.
42

43 Tell us what you can about that entry.

44 A That, in itself, I did not retrieve any recordings
45 on. That was long after the incident. My
46 requirement was to investigate what was going on
47 at the time. This entry was made at 18:53 hours,

13
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 some 16 hours later, 15 hours later.
2 Q Okay. You don't anything about that entry.
3 A No.
4 Q Fair enough. Now, under the -- the next heading
5 is "Unit", "Officer(s)" and "Times". We have
6 three officers listed there. Tell us what you can
7 about those names, why they're listed there and
8 what it means.
9 A The -- it's the unit number or their unit call
10 sign and the officers assigned to that call -- to
11 that unit.
12 Q Okay. How did their names get on this printout?
13 Is that because they responded and said they were
14 on en route or -- how did that happen?
15 A If the dispatcher dispatches them to the call,
16 Richmond-1-Echo-23 was dispatched so it's going to
17 show every officer that was assigned to the call.
18 Richmond --
19 Q How do -- sorry.
20 A 1-Echo-23 was assigned to the call. Richmond 1-
21 Delta-21 was also put on -- placed on the call at
22 1:31 hours.
23 Q And then there's a --
24 A And 1-Echo-24 was also put on the call at 1:31
25 hours.
26 Q Okay. How did they get placed on the call? Did
27 that occur because they phoned into E-Comm and
28 said, "I'm on the call," or did dispatch assign
29 them? How does that take place?
30 A I'd have to listen to the recordings again to
31 confirm what occurred there.
32 Q Okay. Should all officers assigned to a call be
33 listed on this document?
34 A Generally, yes.
35 Q Now, does the Richmond dispatcher make a decision
36 who responds to the call, or is it the officer
37 that makes the decision?
38 A The dispatcher would do the initial broadcast and
39 do the initial assignment of the unit based on who
40 -- who there is available.
41 Q Okay.
42 A The other officers may turn around and offer up
43 that they're close and that they'll cover or
44 assist.
45 Q Okay. So the broadcast does out. Is it then
46 dependent on which members phone back who gets
47 assigned the call?

14
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A Well, they're not -- it's not done on the phone,
2 it's done on the radio --
3 Q So radio back?
4 A If the officers are in the area, they'll -- and
5 they respond. I -- as I said, I haven't listened
6 to the broadcasts for a while, so --
7 Q Okay, that's fine. We'll listen to those.
8 MR. MCGOWAN: Do we have we have extra copies of these?
9 If I might just have a moment here. I'm going to
10 make sure we have extra copies here for the
11 Commissioner.
12 And maybe before we get into playing any of
13 the calls, I'll just continue through. Now, I've
14 just placed up extra copies of A and C for -- for
15 the benefit of the Commissioner.
16 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, I've just got some documents,
17 so I'm lagging.
18 MR. MCGOWAN: Yes.
19 THE COMMISSIONER: The document on the top of which
20 says 1 of 1 is --
21 MR. MCGOWAN: With a large chart on it. My
22 understanding is that's 40A.
23 THE COMMISSIONER: Just a moment. Forty-A and then the
24 one, "Mainland Municipal Department", that is --
25 MR. MCGOWAN: That should be 40C.
26 THE COMMISSIONER: And I have 40B.
27 MR. MCGOWAN: And 40B should be a transcript which came
28 in the middle.
29 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I have it.
30 MR. MCGOWAN: All right.
31 Q Now, I understand that at the time you did your
32 initial investigation and created the chart which
33 is 40A, what you have -- didn't uncover, just
34 because of the peculiarity of the system and the
35 way searches are done, was certain calls that came
36 in from members of the public on either cell
37 phones or personal phones into E-Comm; is that
38 right?
39 A That's correct.
40 Q Okay. You subsequently undertook some additional
41 investigation and actually uncovered some of those
42 calls.
43 A Yes.
44 Q Okay. And you've brought today a computer
45 printout which -- on which you've identified those
46 calls; is that right?
47 A Yes.

15
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 THE COMMISSIONER: All right, 40D.
2 MR. McGOWAN: Okay.
3 THE REGISTRAR: This be marked 40D.

4
5 EXHIBIT 40D: Detailed call report
6

7 MR. McGOWAN: This is 40D. It says at the top left-
8 hand corner, it says today's date is 2009,
9 February 19th, 7:30:16. And in the centre, it
10 says "Genesis 911 + Detailed Call Report."

11 Q And you've done some -- some work and actually
12 listened to some of these calls and determined
13 where they came from; is that right?

14 A Yes, I did.

15 Q And the ones that you've written "Horizon" beside
16 came from somebody you understood to be using a
17 phone number assigned to Horizon Air.

18 A Okay. And there's also some others which are
19 numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, 5. Or, sorry, the 1, 2, 3, 4,
20 5, those are the Horizon Air ones, correct?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Okay. There was also a call from a woman not
23 calling on a Horizon Air phone.

24 A Correct.

25 Q And one from a man who you came to form the view
26 was a limo driver of some sort.

27 Q Yes.

28 Q Okay. And you brought a tape recording -- or a CD
29 with the recordings of these telephone calls on
30 them here today.

31 A Yes.

32 Q Okay. Now, let's start at the top. We'll just go
33 through these. I understand the first two calls
34 with lines through them have nothing to do with
35 this event.

36 A That's correct.

37 Q Okay. The next one, is that a -- that's a call on
38 a -- a number assigned to Horizon Air; is that
39 right?

40 A I believe so, yes.

41 Q Okay. And did that call -- a person speak with
42 anyone on that call?

43 A No.

44 Q Okay. What happened to that call?

45 A The call was, I believe -- I believe it was a
46 hang-up before the operator got through, or before
47 they got through to the operator.

16
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Q So there won't be a recording of this call. Or if
2 there is -- will we hear the hang-ups?
3 A No, I didn't include that. I was led to believe
4 that this Horizon Air incident was nothing to do
5 with the event.
6 Q Okay, fair enough. You didn't understand that the
7 calls might relate to this incident, so you don't
8 have recordings.
9 A No.
10 Q Okay, fair enough. Now, the next call is not from
11 Horizon Air. It looks like it's from a different
12 number and it looks like it's 58 seconds in
13 length. Is that --
14 A Okay. We're looking at 1:22:03?
15 Q At 1:22:03, yes.
16 A Yes.
17 Q Okay. And that call -- tell us what happened with
18 that call if you can.
19 A I believe that is another incomplete or hang-up
20 call.
21 Q So the person came through, they were on hold for
22 a period of time --
23 A Yes.
24 Q -- and ultimately hung up. And the 58 seconds is
25 from the time they phoned to the time they hung up
26 after being on hold.
27 A Yes.
28 Q Okay.
29 A And that's including ring time, so from the time
30 that they dialled the last digit of the 1-1, it's
31 the ring time through Telus and right through to
32 hang-up.
33 Q Okay. So they're on hold for 40 seconds or so,
34 and then hang up.
35 A That's correct.
36 Q Sounds about right? Okay. The next call is at --
37 it's listed here is -- the first time I see is
38 1:21:39 and that's another Horizon Air call --
39 A Yes.
40 Q -- and another hang-up.
41 A Yes.
42 Q Now, there's a couple of different times there,
43 1:21:39 and 1:22:00. Do you know what those
44 differences are?
45 A Yeah, the 1:21:39 is from the time that they
46 dialled the last digit of the 9-1-1 and it starts
47 to connect and ring through to 1:22:00 is the time

17
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 it starts ringing through to the Richmond RCMP.
2 Q Okay. So what happened is the -- the 9-1-1 call
3 operator took it, 20 seconds later approximately
4 they forward it to Richmond -- the Richmond
5 dispatcher where the person is put on hold and
6 they hang up about 50 seconds later.
7 A Yeah. It's -- they're not put on hold. The call
8 hasn't actually reached through to an available
9 operator.
10 Q Oh, but they're in the queue.
11 A Yeah.
12 Q And then they hang up. And we've got similar
13 hang-ups again from the Horizon Air phone with the
14 calls you've numbered 3 and 4 with times of 34 and
15 29 seconds, right?
16 A Yes.
17 Q Okay. Now, the next two calls, if I understand
18 what you told me when we met earlier, these are
19 circumstances where 9-1-1 is calling back -- or E-
20 Comm is calling back to these numbers because of
21 the hang-ups; is that right?
22 A Yeah, these ones that I've marked with CBK are
23 call back, are the ones that I was actually able
24 to locate. The phone calls that I brought are the
25 actual call back -- I --
26 Q Okay. So -- so --
27 A -- I didn't put the, "Hello, hello," nobody there.
28 What I did was I went and searched, okay, somebody
29 -- one of the operators would have called back on
30 this to check, and what I did get was the result
31 of that operator calling back to check that phone
32 number.
33 Q Okay. So when a call -- somebody hangs up, E-Comm
34 phones back to see why.
35 A Yes.
36 Q Okay. And that resulted in you finding -- in
37 these two calls which you've circled.
38 A Yes.
39 Q And put stars and checks beside.
40 A Yes.
41 Q Okay. And that's what you have recordings of
42 today.
43 A Yes, the ones -- they're not this actual
44 recording. They're as a result of these phone
45 calls being made.
46 Q Yes, I understand. Okay. And you -- one of those
47 is a woman and one's a man?

18
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A That's correct.
2 Q Okay. And the final call is another Horizon Air
3 call which you don't have a recording for, or you
4 do?
5 A I do not.
6 Q Okay. And it's a minute and 25 seconds. Was that
7 another hang-up?
8 A What time are you looking at now?
9 Q Sorry, 1:25 in the morning, 20 seconds. Is that
10 another hang-up -- 1:25:06.
11 A 1:25:06, yes, it is.
12 Q Okay. That's --
13 A So in actuality, that -- that one -- one phone
14 five times had called through, and that's actually
15 tying up the 9-1-1 trunks of five people within
16 that five -- within that five-minute time period
17 or that time span, so you've got five queue
18 operators that are trying to get through and
19 waiting in queue for the next available Richmond
20 operator.
21 Q Okay.
22 A All being the same caller.
23 Q Okay. I understand. Now, we heard some -- a
24 little bit about the time goals of five and ten
25 seconds earlier, and we see some of these calls
26 are a fair bit longer than that. Is that unusual?
27 This was about 1:30 in the morning.
28 A It all depends on what's going on in the city that
29 night.
30 Q Okay. Do you -- do you happen to know personally
31 what was going on at E-Comm that night at this
32 time?
33 A No.
34 Q What sorts of things might make calls take a
35 little longer to be answered than the goal?
36 A A fight in a bar.
37 Q Okay.
38 A Everybody with a cell phone will be calling in, a
39 stabbing, a motor vehicle accident.
40 Q Okay. So any event which is going to cause a
41 large volume of calls to E-Comm, especially
42 centred in the same area.
43 A Yeah.
44 Q Is that the type of thing which would call --
45 cause call responses to be delayed?
46 A Yes.
47 Q Now, is that all the documents that you have that

19
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 relate, other than your own personal e-mails and
2 internal work, that relate to the RCMP or calls
3 from the public in?
4 A Yeah, I believe so.
5 Q Now, you also, you told us, do dispatch -- the E-
6 Comm does dispatch for the Richmond Fire; is that
7 right?
8 A That's correct.
9 Q Okay. And I should just say you've also provided
10 -- you provided originally to IHIT recordings of
11 the calls involving the RCMP and the airport; is
12 that correct?
13 A That's correct.
14 Q Okay. And we'll get to those in a minute. Now,
15 you -- with respect to Richmond Fire, there's also
16 a CAD generated for communication between them and
17 E-Comm; is that right?
18 A Correct.
19 Q Okay. And does that get sent to them over the
20 radio as well?
21 A Yes.
22 Q Okay. And is this --
23 A Well, I'd have to have a look at it as to whether
24 or not that was a combined event or not.
25 Q Okay. Well, I'll place a copy in front of you.
26 That last document we were talking about, does it
27 have a letter yet, Mr. Giles? The detailed call
28 report?
29 THE REGISTRAR: D.
30 MR. MCGOWAN: D, thank you.
31 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. This will be 40E.
32 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you, 40E.
33
34 EXHIBIT 40E: Event History Record, CAD for
35 Richmond Fire
36
37 MR. MCGOWAN:
38 Q Now, this is the CAD report for Richmond Fire?
39 A Yes.
40 Q Okay. And it's got some times and those are
41 generated the same way as the other times we
42 talked about?
43 A Yes.
44 Q Okay. And let's just go through. What does "WAI"
45 stand for?
46 A Waiting.
47 Q What does "waiting" mean?

20
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A That's from the time that -- the time that the
2 call was put up for dispatch.
3 Q Okay. So the call was put up for dispatch at
4 1:34:09. Tell us what DSP means at 1:34:29.
5 A Dispatch. The call was dispatched at the time --
6 Q Is that the time that the call was made verbally
7 to Richmond Fire?
8 A Yes.
9 Q Okay. We've heard something about rip-and-run
10 printer. Do you know about that?
11 A I know they have them at the hall, so --
12 Q Okay. Is that -- is this also the time that the
13 information would be coming off the rip-and-run?
14 A I believe it would be, yes.
15 Q Okay. What does ENR stand for?
16 A En route.
17 Q Okay. So is this the time -- now, this is the
18 time that the fire truck starts. Is that done by
19 pressing a button or by calling in or do you know?
20 A No, I'm sorry, I can't answer that.
21 Q ONS, is that on scene?
22 A Yes.
23 Q Okay. And again, do you know how that time is
24 generated?
25 A Either verbally or pressing the button and --
26 Q And you can't tell from this printout?
27 A Not from this printout.
28 Q Fair enough. And --
29 A Oh, yes, I can, actually. On scene was done by
30 the actual unit.
31 Q And what about en route?
32 A By the unit.
33 Q Okay. And CLS, is that cleared scene?
34 A Closed. Closing the event.
35 Q Oh, closed, okay. And that means the call's
36 concluded?
37 A Yes.
38 Q Okay. Does this sheet tell us what information
39 was communicated on the rip-and-run to the fire
40 department?
41 A It would have been the address, Arrivals level
42 collapse, caller: B.C. Ambulance.
43 Q Okay. So that's the -- that's the information we
44 see in the top left-hand corner beside the word
45 "Info".
46 A Yes.
47 Q Now, you actually searched out the radio

21
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 transmissions for this as well and had a
2 transcript created?

3 A Yes.

4 Q It says "E-Comm 9-1-1" at the top, "Recorded Radio
5 Activity."

6 A Yes.

7 MR. MCGOWAN: If that could be the next lettered
8 exhibit, please.

9 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, 40F.

10 THE REGISTRAR: 40F.

11 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you.

12

13 EXHIBIT 40F: E-Comm 9-1-1 Recorded Radio
14 Activity

15

16 MR. MCGOWAN:

17 Q You don't have recordings with you of the calls to
18 Fire, but you've satisfied yourself that this
19 transcript represents what was said verbally
20 between the dispatcher and Richmond Fire?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Okay. Now, the radio -- it says RIF, is that
23 Richmond Fire, RIF?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Okay. And "Radio 12", is that the number of the
26 call?

27 A That's -- "Radio 12" is the actual name given to
28 the actual audio segment.

29 Q Okay. The date obviously is the date of the call?

30 A Yes.

31 Q And the time, 1:35:52 to 1:36:23, that's the time
32 on the voice recorder; is that right?

33 A The time extracted from the voice logger, yes.

34 Q Okay. And you've already told us that that's not
35 necessarily in sync -- in fact we perhaps can see
36 that it's not in sync with what's on the CAD; is
37 that right?

38 A That's correct.

39 Q Okay. Do you know if the voice recorder which
40 recorded the Richmond Fire calls and the voice
41 recorder which recorded the calls to Richmond RCMP
42 are in sync? Is it the same timer?

43 A I'm just trying to think whether or not they're on
44 the same logger.

45 Q Okay. If you're not sure, that's fine.

46 A No, I'm just going to check the document here.

47 Q Okay, fair enough.

22
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A I don't -- no, I don't have a recording details
2 list like I do on item A. I can't tell you
3 whether or not they're on the same logger. I
4 believe they are, but it's possible they may be on
5 a separate logger so they could be out by a couple
6 of seconds, but...
7 Q Okay, fair enough. Now, we see that DISP is
8 Richmond Fire. It says that right on the document
9 -- or, sorry, Richmond Fire dispatcher, pardon me.
10 A Yes.
11 Q That's a person at E-Comm?
12 A Yes.
13 Q And RIE04 is Richmond fire engine 4?
14 A Yes.
15 Q Okay. And these are a transcript of the actual
16 words spoken over the radio?
17 A Yes.
18 Q Okay.
19 THE COMMISSIONER: Just again, DISP is dispatch, who's
20 is this?
21 A The RIE04 is Richmond engine 4.
22 THE COMMISSIONER: Yeah, but the other one, DISP above
23 it?
24 A That's the dispatcher, the Richmond Fire
25 dispatcher.
26 MR. MCGOWAN:
27 Q That's an E-Comm employee situated at E-Comm
28 headquarters --
29 A Yes.
30 Q -- who's specifically assigned to do dispatch for
31 Richmond Fire and Rescue; is that right?
32 A Yes.
33 Q Okay. And they go on the radio and they say what
34 we see written down here.
35 A Yes.
36 Q Now, I understand that we have recordings from E-
37 Comm which have been distributed to the various
38 participants of all of the calls --
39 THE COMMISSIONER: Just let -- excuse me, just let me
40 interrupt again.
41 MR. MCGOWAN: Absolutely.
42 THE COMMISSIONER: On this one, 40F, this last one,
43 you've got RIF Radio 12, and then a time, and then
44 dispatch, and we know that that came from the E-
45 Comm office from the part that's dedicated to
46 making dispatches to Richmond Fire. And now it
47 says "TONE" and then some words:

23
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Richmond Engine Four respond...
2
3 Now, where is that coming from?
4 A That is the voice of the dispatcher.
5 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. And that goes loud into
6 the truck?
7 A It goes through to the hall and to the truck.
8 THE COMMISSIONER: And -- but it's *viva voce*, it's not
9 printed in a computer. It's -- they hear it.
10 A No, they hear it.
11 THE COMMISSIONER: They hear it, okay.
12 MR. MCGOWAN:
13 Q So when the firefighters are sitting in the hall
14 waiting for a call to come in, they hear a loud
15 tone to let them know a call is coming in?
16 A Yes.
17 Q And this is broadcast orally throughout the fire
18 hall?
19 A Yeah.
20 Q This is what tells them what -- the nature of the
21 call, where it is, and gets them moving.
22 A Yes.
23 Q Okay. And the subsequent calls from the -- from
24 Richmond engine 4 to the dispatcher would be the
25 firefighter in the fire engine talking on the
26 radio to, again, the dispatcher at E-Comm.
27 A That's correct.
28 Q Okay. Now, I think that's all we -- that's all we
29 have in the way of documentation related to the E-
30 Comm calls, is that right, other than your
31 internal investigation documents?
32 A Yeah.
33 Q Okay, you're nodding.
34 A I believe so, yes.
35 Q Okay. Now, what I'm going to do at this point is
36 why don't we start with the two calls that you
37 found just this morning and we'll perhaps play
38 those. I understand that you have those on a CD?
39 A Yes, I do.
40 MR. MCGOWAN: Perhaps if the Commissioner could direct
41 you to provide those to the Commission and then
42 we'll enter those as the next exhibit.
43 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, go ahead.
44 MR. MCGOWAN: If you can just give those to Mr. Giles,
45 please. I wonder if that should be the next
46 numbered exhibit, perhaps. Or do you want to keep
47 it --

24
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, all right, 41.

2 THE REGISTRAR: That will be marked as Exhibit 41.

3

4 EXHIBIT 41: E-Comm Audio CD

5

6 MR. MCGOWAN: If that could perhaps be provided to Dr.

7 Perra so he could play those calls for us.

8 Q Now, we don't have a transcript of these calls, do
9 we, ma'am?

10 A No, I just did them -- just found them this
11 morning.

12 Q I understand, fair enough.

13 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, just before they're played, I
14 haven't got it clear. What are they?

15 A They're the two phone calls that I was able to
16 identify, that we had two -- the bottom -- the
17 bottom two phone calls that are circled, they're
18 actually the call-back to check on the incomplete
19 phone call.

20 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. I understand that.

21 MR. MCGOWAN:

22 Q So you provided is -- one of the sheets you
23 provided us with, 40D, I believe it is, is a
24 Detailed Call Report, and that's the calls that
25 you uncovered with your most recent investigation.

26 A Yes.

27 Q They were calls that were missed the first time
28 around with the computer search.

29 A Yes.

30 Q Okay.

31 A Because of the way that I had searched the
32 computer. If they -- yeah.

33 Q Right. Fair enough. You undertook a search that
34 you thought would capture anything and after
35 thinking about it later, you thought maybe I'll
36 try one more thing and you caught a few more
37 calls.

38 A Yes.

39 Q And that happened this morning.

40 A Yes.

41 Q And those -- the two calls you captured are call-
42 backs, so they're the 9-1-1 operator or the
43 dispatcher calling back to people who had
44 previously called and hung up.

45 A Yes.

46 Q And we believe one of those is a limo driver.

47 A Yes.

25
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Q And one is a woman.

2 A Yes.

3 Q And those are the two calls we're going to play
4 right now. Do you know which one is first?

5 A I believe the female is the first call.

6 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. Dr. Perra, are we able to play
7 those right now? Unfortunately, Mr. Commissioner,
8 we weren't able to see the CD ahead of time, so
9 I'm not sure if we've --

10 THE COMMISSIONER: No, that's fine.

11 MR. MCGOWAN: -- got all the technical aspects sorted
12 out.

13

14 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

15 (AUDIO STOPPED)

16

17 MR. MCGOWAN:

18 Q Okay. So that's the first call. Now, in terms of
19 time, that call came in after the RCMP had been
20 dispatched, it seems.

21 A Yes.

22 Q So that's not information that formed the basis of
23 the original dispatch.

24 A No, the -- I believe by that time, and it's
25 already on the other CD, was Ops calling and they
26 were already en route. That's why they arrived
27 there at this time.

28 Q Okay, fair enough. Now, let's hear the other call
29 that's coming in. It looks like at almost the
30 same time, within a few seconds of the call we
31 just heard; is that right?

32 A Yes. Actually, I do have the recording detail
33 that -- from the computer here that you don't
34 have.

35 Q Let me just have a quick look at that.

36 A It's the time stamping of those two calls.
37 They're really tiny.

38 Q So let me just -- I'm going to ask you a few
39 questions about this and then I'll show it to you.
40 Maybe we'll enter it as the next exhibit and have
41 copies made.

42 Forty-D has times beside these calls, but
43 those were actually -- those aren't the times that
44 these recordings took place, right, that these
45 calls that we just heard took place; is that
46 right?

47 A Yeah, that document you have there now is

26
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 basically the same thing as what 40D is.
2 Q Okay. But I notice the time --
3 A I mean 40A.
4 Q Okay, 40A, I see. So the time on this document
5 provides us an accurate time stamp of when the
6 calls we -- the call we just heard and the one
7 we're about to hear actually took place.
8 A Yes. Based on the logger time, the radio logger.
9 Q Based --
10 A Or the phone logger.
11 Q Based on the phone logger.
12 A Yes.
13 Q Okay.
14 THE COMMISSIONER: I think we'll make that 40D-1.
15 MR. MCGOWAN: Forty D-1, okay.
16 THE REGISTRAR: Forty D-1?
17
18 EXHIBIT 40D-1: Transmission log VR07-2174
19
20 MR. MCGOWAN:
21 Q Now, I have what appears to be just -- is there
22 just a start time and a stop time? The first call
23 starts at 1:28:26 and concludes at 1:29:28?
24 A Correct.
25 Q And the next one starts at 1:29:03?
26 A Yes.
27 Q And concludes at 1:29:35.
28 A Yes.
29 Q Okay. And they have extension numbers 2111 and
30 2117.
31 A Yes.
32 Q Is the call we just heard associated with the 2111
33 extension or the other extension.
34 A 2111.
35 Q Okay. So the call we just heard is the 2111 call.
36 A Yes.
37 MR. MCGOWAN: I just have the one copy. I'll pass that
38 up now.
39 THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you.
40 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. If we can play the next call,
41 please, from that CD.
42
43 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)
44 (AUDIO STOPPED)
45
46 MR. MCGOWAN:
47 Q So those are the other -- those are the two new

1 substantive calls that you found where
2 communication actually took place about the
3 incident between a member of the public and E-
4 Comm.
5 A That's correct.
6 Q Okay. Now, the calls you found from your initial
7 search are reflected in the transcript that you
8 provided to us, correct?
9 A Yes.
10 Q Okay. Or that we entered as the exhibit. Now, I
11 just want to make sure that mine is the same.
12 Now, the transcript that you gave us, or that we
13 had -- perhaps it's from IHIT -- you determined
14 didn't have the calls in the correct order; is
15 that right?
16 A That's correct.
17 MR. MCGOWAN: If I may just have a moment, Mr.
18 Commissioner. Now, Mr. Commissioner, I understand
19 that we have just, this morning, taken --
20 attempted to re-order the calls in the right
21 order. We haven't yet had copies of that made,
22 but we're going to attempt to have that done
23 shortly.
24 I'm going to have the calls played --
25 THE COMMISSIONER: Are you looking at 40B, are you?
26 MR. MCGOWAN: I'm looking at 40B, although what I have
27 as 40 -- I have a copy of 40B re-ordered with the
28 times put in which I think would probably be
29 helpful for you, Mr. Commissioner, and for the
30 other counsel. I'm in your hands. I can either
31 play them in the timed order or we can stand down
32 for just a minute and have copies of this made for
33 people. I'm content to just to play them and file
34 this later if that's --
35 THE COMMISSIONER: Yeah, just go ahead and play them.
36 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay, fair enough. Now, I'm going to --
37 if it's suitable to you, Mr. Commissioner, I'll
38 announce the times of the calls and have them
39 played in what I believe to be chronological order
40 so we can get a better sense of them.
41 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. Which is first?
42 MR. MCGOWAN: It's going to be titled "WAV File (PHONES
43 2)".
44 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. Well, that is first.
45 MR. HARRIS: I'm sorry, we couldn't hear you, sir.
46 We've got construction behind us.
47 MR. MCGOWAN: Certainly, "WAV File (PHONES 2)".

28
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 MR. HARRIS: Thank you.

2 MR. McGOWAN: And my understanding is that this call --
3 sorry, I can't be more specific, but I think it
4 starts at approximately 1:24:48, and I understand
5 this to be a call between -- it says "unnamed
6 female", but I believe this to be Ms. Hanson at
7 the airport and the Richmond dispatch. Perhaps we
8 could play that call, please.

9

10 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

11 (AUDIO STOPPED)

12

13 MR. McGOWAN:

14 Q Now, ma'am, do you still have 40A in front of you,
15 the chart?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Okay. Are the calls on here in the right order?

18 A Yes.

19 Q Okay. So I think that must be -- that's how we've
20 re-ordered them and we've taken the times from
21 this chart. So I'll play them in the order listed
22 on 40A, I think. We're next going to play "RIP D1
23 3". Is RIP Richmond Police?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Okay. And what does "D1" mean?

26 A It's the radio channel name.

27 Q Okay, and "3"?

28 A That's just the segment that the --

29 Q You've numbered them.

30 A Yeah.

31 Q Okay. And the times there again are from the
32 voice recorder, not from the computer which is
33 coordinated with --

34 A No, that's --

35 Q -- Greenwich Mean Time.

36 A -- from the voice logger.

37 MR. McGOWAN: Okay. If we could play the next one
38 which is "RIP D1 3".

39

40 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

41 (AUDIO STOPPED)

42

43 MR. McGOWAN:

44 Q Okay. So the -- yeah, so the first call we heard
45 was the call from the airport into Richmond
46 dispatch complaining about the incident.

47 A Yes.

Sandi Greenfield

In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Q The call we just heard is Richmond dispatch
2 dispatching the call to the Richmond RCMP.

3 A That's correct.

4 Q And it doesn't appear to be assigned to a
5 particular officer or a particular member; is that
6 right?

7 A Richmond 23.

8 Q Okay, but the Richmond dispatcher, it doesn't look
9 -- correct me if I'm wrong, but it doesn't look
10 like they specifically sought out Richmond 2-3 to
11 assign this call to; is that right? They've just
12 announced it generally?

13 A No, she broadcast it and Richmond 23 responded.

14 Q Okay. So it's broadcast generally, and the reason
15 it's assigned to Richmond 2-3 is because Richmond
16 2-3 calls back.

17 A Yeah.

18 Q Okay. The next call is "PHONES FILE 4". And just
19 so we know, RIP, is that a Richmond radio call, do
20 we know -- is that what that means?

21 A Yeah.

22 Q And "PHONES" means it's a telephone call?

23 A Yes.

24 MR. MCGOWAN: So we'll now play "PHONES FILE 4".
25 That's the next chronologically.

26

27 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

28 (AUDIO STOPPED)

29

30 MR. MCGOWAN:

31 Q And that's another call from the airport?

32 A Yes.

33 Q And they have a direct line to E-Comm, correct?

34 A Yes.

35 Q Okay. The next file is a "WAV FILE RIP D1 5".
36 This is another call between Richmond dispatch and
37 the RCMP?

38 A Yes, radio -- radio --

39 Q Before we play it, the first thing I see is:

40

41 Echo-9 or Echo-15, Richmond checking.

42

43 Do you know what that means?

44 A The dispatcher is checking up on the status of the
45 officers.

46 Q What does Echo-9 or Echo-15 mean?

47 A It's the unit call signs of the members that are

30
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 on call.

2 Q Okay. They know which Richmond members are
3 working that night?

4 A Yeah, and they actually get an indicator on their
5 computers to check their status to make sure
6 they're okay.

7 MR. BUTCHER: I'm sorry, I'm looking at 40A and do not
8 see that.

9 MR. MCGOWAN: I'm reading from the transcript which is
10 40B.

11 THE COMMISSIONER: It's the top of page 5.

12 MR. MCGOWAN: Yeah, it's been provided previously. I
13 have some extra copies if I can -- so just for the
14 assistance of my friends, Mr. Commissioner, the
15 transcript which was provided by the RCMP, by
16 IHIT, has the calls not in chronological order.
17 They're listed chronologically on 40A. That's the
18 order we're playing them in.

19 Q I'm looking at the transcript and I see a
20 reference to Oscar-5. Is that another reference
21 to a police --

22 A Yes.

23 Q -- call sign?

24 A Yes.

25 MR. MCGOWAN: All right. If we could play "RIP FILE
26 5", please.

27

28 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

29 (AUDIO STOPPED)

30

31 MR. MCGOWAN:

32 Q So this appears to be a telephone call, an update
33 from Richmond dispatch to the police officer?

34 A No, it's radio transmissions.

35 Q Sorry, yes, a radio transmission. But is it
36 Richmond dispatch updating --

37 A Yes.

38 Q -- the officer with new information?

39 A Yes.

40 Q Okay. And the officer that's speaking appears to
41 be Echo 2-3?

42 A Yes.

43 Q Okay. And the time of the voice recorder at least
44 is noted on Exhibit 40A.

45 A Yes.

46 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. Now, the next in time I understand
47 to be just a brief recording, "RIP FILE 6".

31
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

2 (AUDIO STOPPED)

3

4 MR. MCGOWAN:

5 Q That's the dispatcher checking in with the police
6 officer again, Echo 2-3?

7 A Yes, and most likely --

8 Q Or, pardon me, Echo 2-1.

9 A Most likely because of what was heard just prior
10 to.

11 Q There's no recorded response at least at this
12 point.

13 A No, unless we listen to the next track.

14 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. Well, the next is "RIP D7" -- or
15 "D1 7".

16

17 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

18 (AUDIO STOPPED)

19

20 MR. MCGOWAN:

21 Q That's again Richmond dispatch?

22 A Yes.

23 MR. MCGOWAN: The next is "RIP FILE 8".

24

25 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

26 (AUDIO STOPPED)

27

28 MR. MCGOWAN:

29 Q So that called seemed pretty self-explanatory.
30 It's a -- I take it if there's a mike keyed and
31 something unusual heard, Richmond dispatch follows
32 up on that?

33 A Yes.

34 Q And that's what we hear occurring, at least in
35 part, on these recordings.

36 A Yes.

37 Q Okay. Next we'll play "RIP FILE 9".

38

39 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

40 (AUDIO STOPPED)

41

42 MR. MCGOWAN:

43 Q Okay, so that's -- the call we just heard is a
44 police officer with the call 2-4 calling Richmond
45 dispatch and asking for EHS.

46 A Correct.

47 Q EHS means Ambulance?

32
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A Yes.
2 Q Okay, so the procedure is a -- is this standard
3 procedure, if a police officer wants an ambulance
4 to a scene? They --
5 A Yes.
6 Q Okay. So they call Richmond dispatch on the
7 radio; is that right?
8 A Yes.
9 Q And Richmond dispatch then in turn gets in touch
10 with B.C. Ambulance dispatch?
11 A Yes.
12 Q Okay. And the question routine or Code 3 is a
13 question as to whether they're looking for an
14 ambulance coming fast with lights and sirens or
15 whether they're looking for an ambulance just on a
16 routine basis; is that right?
17 A That's correct.
18 Q Okay. And the response here initially is routine.
19 We hear that.
20 A Yes.
21 Q Okay. Now, the time on the voice recorder for
22 this call ran from 1:32:25 to 1:32:37.
23 A Correct.
24 Q Okay. Now, the next call I have starting just two
25 seconds later. Is that what you see on the voice
26 recorder?
27 A Yes.
28 Q The voice recorder timer.
29 A No, 1:32:49.
30 Q Oh, pardon me, so 12 seconds later.
31 A 12 seconds later.
32 Q Okay. So the call -- if we could play that call
33 which is "RIP" -- and this -- we've now started
34 using letters instead of numbers, so this is "RIP
35 A"?
36 A Yeah, it's the hexadecimal numbering system that
37 the computer generates.
38 Q Fair enough. Okay.
39 MR. MCGOWAN: So this is "RIP FILE A" commencing,
40 according to the voice timer, at 1:32:49, 12
41 seconds after the last call.
42
43 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)
44 (AUDIO STOPPED)
45
46 MR. MCGOWAN:
47 Q And again, the time for these calls, when you

33
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 pulled them off the voice recorder, that's a
2 computer-maintained time?
3 A Yes.
4 Q Okay. So certainly the time counters for the
5 calls to Richmond - and tell me if I'm wrong - but
6 I think I understand from what you said the time
7 counter for any radio calls to Richmond RCMP,
8 those would be synchronized?
9 A Yes.
10 Q Okay. So we do know that this call was 12 seconds
11 after the previous one ended?
12 A That's correct.
13 Q Okay. Now, the next call I think we hear is
14 Richmond dispatch speaking with B.C. Ambulance.
15 A That's correct.
16 Q Okay. And that's going to be "PHONES FILE B".
17 A Yes.
18 THE COMMISSIONER: Just a minute now. I'm trying to
19 find it.
20 MR. MCGOWAN: It should be titled "WAV FILE PHONES B".
21 THE COMMISSIONER: What page is it on?
22 MR. STEWART: It's page 2 of 8, bottom of page 2.
23 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you. Sorry, I'm working from a
24 slightly different copy. Maybe I'll see if I --
25 A It actually starts on page 3.
26 THE COMMISSIONER: Three? Oh, got it.
27 A Right at the top.
28 THE COMMISSIONER: Got it.
29 MR. MCGOWAN: If we could play that file, please.
30
31 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)
32 (AUDIO STOPPED)
33
34 MR. MCGOWAN: The next call in time is "RIP FILE C".
35 Just wait a minute while people find that in the
36 transcript. I think that's on page 4 -- oh, I
37 might have that wrong, sorry. Page 7. Go ahead
38 with that, please.
39
40 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)
41 (AUDIO STOPPED)
42
43 MR. MCGOWAN:
44 Q And that's Richmond dispatch getting back to the
45 police telling them that EHS advised of the Code
46 3?
47 A That's correct.

Sandi Greenfield

In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 Q And that transmission would go over the radio to
2 be heard by any of the RCMP officers?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Okay. And it would either be heard in their
5 earpiece or through the speaker, depending on how
6 they have their radio set?

7 A That's correct.

8 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. Then the next file I have is
9 labelled "PHONES D" and it's another communication
10 between B.C. Ambulance and Richmond dispatch. I
11 have it starting on page 3. If we could play
12 "PHONES D", please.

13
14 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

15 (AUDIO STOPPED)

16
17 MR. MCGOWAN:

18 Q Now, that was Richmond dispatch speaking with the
19 ambulance and I think the next call we're going to
20 see is -- well, I'm going to get you to tell me
21 what that is, because I think it's perhaps members
22 speaking amongst themselves and Richmond dispatch.
23 It's "RIP FILE E" which is on page 7. Do you have
24 that call, the transcript, in front of you, ma'am?

25 A Yes, I do.

26 Q Okay. Can you tell us what's happening here from
27 looking at the transcript, who's speaking or
28 anything about it?

29 A I believe it would be Richmond 1-Echo-15 or Echo-
30 54 with Echo-15.

31 Q So it's two RCMP members speaking one to the other
32 over the radio?

33 A Yeah.

34 Q Now, are radio communications between RCMP members
35 all recorded by your E-Comm system?

36 A Yes.

37 Q So if one of the members at the scene had spoken
38 to another member over the radio, we'd have it
39 here.

40 A Yes.

41 Q Okay. And this is one example of that.

42 A Yes.

43 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. So if we could play the next file,
44 please, "WAV RIP E".

45
46 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

47

35
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 (AUDIO STOPPED)

2
3 MR. MCGOWAN:

4 Q Now, we heard one of the officers say:

5
6 Can you go TAC One for a sec?

7
8 Do you know what that means?

9 A Yes, I do. That transmission is unrelated. It's
10 not related to the incident at all.

11 Q Okay. Fair enough. It just got in there by
12 mistake?

13 A Well, it's -- it was part and parcel of the
14 segment, and I did not vet any audio from the
15 investigation. It was part and parcel of the
16 segment that had the Richmond "2-4 go with the
17 file number, please."

18 Q Okay.

19 A So, yeah, it ended up in there. It is an
20 unrelated transmission from units not on location.

21 Q Okay. So the people speaking there weren't on
22 location, have nothing to do with his.

23 A No.

24 MR. MCGOWAN: Fair enough. The next we have -- that I
25 have in time is "RIP F" on page 7, again, and it
26 looks like it's Richmond dispatch speaking with an
27 RCMP officer, if we could play that, please.

28
29 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)

30 (AUDIO STOPPED)

31
32 MR. MCGOWAN:

33 Q Okay. That's E-Comm following up on the dropped
34 Horizon call or the hang-up from the Horizon call.

35 A Yeah, the five.

36 Q Okay. The five hang-ups from Horizon, okay. The
37 next call in time is "RIP FILE 10." Is that a
38 ten?

39 A Yes.

40 Q Okay. So we're back to using numbers again.

41 A Yes. It goes --

42 Q It's the way the computer does it.

43 A Yeah.

44 Q All right. I think -- correct me if I'm wrong,
45 but I think that's on page 6 of the transcript.
46 Is that the right call?

47 A Yes.

36
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. And if we could play that call,
2 please, "RIP 10".
3

4 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)
5 (AUDIO STOPPED)
6

7 MR. MCGOWAN:

8 Q That's another communication about the Horizon Air
9 call. And then the final call I believe we have
10 that you captured relating to this incident is
11 "RIP 11", the next call in the transcript and it
12 relates to EHS arriving on scene?

13 A That's correct.

14 Q And the time for this, according to the voice
15 recorder timer, is 1:47:22 as the time the call
16 commences, correct?

17 A Okay.

18 MR. MCGOWAN: Let's play that call, please.

19 THE COMMISSIONER: What was it again, 1:47...?

20 MR. MCGOWAN: 1:47:22.

21 THE COMMISSIONER: And that's when it was --

22 MR. MCGOWAN: That's the time -- that's the starting
23 point of this radio communication where the police
24 say "EHS is on scene looking at the male now."

25 Q Now, EHS, does that mean fire or ambulance or do
26 you know?

27 A B.C. Ambulance.

28 Q Okay. In E-Comm lingo or police lingo, EHS means
29 ambulance, not fire?

30 A Yes.

31 (AUDIO BEING PLAYED)
32 (AUDIO STOPPED)
33

34 MR. MCGOWAN: Now, we've heard some of the police
35 officers speaking -- perhaps before I move on, I
36 have a CD which I understand has those files on
37 it. Perhaps that should be the next numbered
38 exhibit.

39 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, all right.

40 THE REGISTRAR: That'll be Exhibit number 42.

41
42 EXHIBIT 42: E-Comm audio CD containing 16
43 WAV files
44

45 MR. MCGOWAN:

46 Q Now, do you still have 40C in front of you? It
47 was the CAD report for the RCMP.

Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Sorry, we've got all sorts of paper stacked in
3 front of you here. Now, on the second page of
4 that document we have three officers listed by
5 name with some numbers before them, and then even
6 before that, unit numbers listed. Let me ask you
7 first of all, we heard people referring to
8 themselves by numbers and at times there was
9 prefixes like "Echo". Do you those relate to an
10 officer or a police vehicle?
- 11 A They -- those relate to the actual unit call sign.
- 12 Q Now, when you say "unit", do you mean car?
- 13 A Yeah, it's their -- their call sign for the night.
- 14 Q Okay. So a police officer, if they're driving a
15 different car, does their call sign change?
- 16 A They may. I believe it's associated to their
17 assignment.
- 18 Q To their assignment, okay. So one officer -- for
19 the purposes of this incident, the officers will
20 always have the same call sign.
- 21 A Throughout this incident, yes.
- 22 Q Throughout this incident. Okay. And can you tell
23 by looking at the second page of this CAD document
24 which call signs were assigned to which officers
25 for this incident at least?
- 26 A Yes.
- 27 Q Okay. I wonder if you could help the Commissioner
28 with that, please.
- 29 A Millington was associated to 1-Echo-23; Rundel to
30 1-Delta-21; and Bentley to 1-Echo-24.
- 31 Q Okay. Now, sometimes we just hear 2-4 or 2-3. Is
32 it common for the 1-Echo or the 1-Delta to be
33 dropped?
- 34 A Oh, yeah.
- 35 Q Okay. Are you satisfied with the searches you've
36 done now that you've captured all recordings
37 involving E-Comm or the dispatch for Richmond Fire
38 or Richmond Police and that we've now heard them
39 today?
- 40 A I believe so.
- 41 MR. MCGOWAN: Okay. If I might just have a moment, Mr.
42 Commissioner.
- 43 Q Let me just ask you this. We can tell who's
44 calling where there's a call sign. If a person is
45 calling -- if one of the calls with the Richmond
46 Police doesn't have a call sign used orally, can
47 you tell who it came from?

38
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 A Personally, myself, no.
2 Q Okay. Is the only way to do that by recognizing
3 the voice?
4 A Yes. Well, the dispatcher may see it by the queue
5 that comes up on their -- on their dispatch
6 screen. I mean --
7 Q But that's not something that's recorded on any of
8 the documents we have?
9 A No.
10 MR. MCGOWAN: Just a moment, please.
11 Q Now, I see -- I'm looking at the transcript again
12 at "RIP FILE 6".
13 A Page...?
14 THE COMMISSIONER: I'd be most obliged if you would use
15 exhibit numbers.
16 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you, Mr. Commissioner. I'm looking
17 at 40B, and I'm looking at "RIP FILE 6" which is
18 on page 5, and it's the transcript of that call.
19 Q Now, we see the Richmond dispatcher -- do you have
20 that in front of you?
21 A Yes.
22 Q We see the Richmond dispatcher say:
23
24 Echo Two-One, Richmond checking.
25
26 A Yes.
27 Q I don't see a listing here of an Echo 2-1.
28 A That's correct.
29 Q Okay. Could that refer to Delta 2-1? Is it -- do
30 mistakes get made or are they fairly careful with
31 that or -- I'm just trying to see if we can sort
32 that out. I don't know if you can help us or not.
33 A Because of the sound that she'd heard, she'd heard
34 the struggle --
35 Q Yes.
36 A -- and she's calling specifically Echo 2-1, and it
37 is my interpretation at this point, having been a
38 dispatcher, that in fact she's looking at what
39 they call a "push-to-talk". It's an indication of
40 what mike was keyed.
41 Q So she would have it sitting on her computer in
42 front of her --
43 A Yeah.
44 Q -- the actual designation, Echo 2-1.
45 A Yes. So she's not necessarily aware that he is on
46 location at that call.
47 Q Okay. Fair enough. Do you know whether Echo 2-1

39
Sandi Greenfield
In chief by Mr. McGowan

1 was on location at that call?

2 A Sorry, I don't.

3 Q Okay.

4 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you very much for helping, ma'am.
5 Those are my questions. Some of the other lawyers
6 may have questions for you.

7 THE COMMISSIONER: I'll take a break if you want, but
8 is there anybody wants to ask any questions? You
9 have some? Well, we'll take a break, then. Mr.
10 McGowan and Ms. Greenfield, thank you very much.
11 That's quite a task. We'll break for ten minutes.

12 THE REGISTRAR: The hearing will now recess for ten
13 minutes.

14

15 (WITNESS STOOD DOWN)

16

17 (PROCEEDINGS ADJOURNED FOR MORNING RECESS)

18 (PROCEEDINGS RECONVENED)

19

20 SANDI GREENFIELD, a witness,
21 recalled.

22

23 THE REGISTRAR: The hearing is now resumed.

24 MR. MCGOWAN: Thank you for the extra time, Mr.
25 Commissioner. It allowed us to work forward on
26 one of the other issues that we'll be dealing with
27 later.

28 When we were going through Ms. Greenfield's
29 evidence, I mentioned that I have a transcript
30 that's got some times entered on it. It's been
31 distributed now. I wonder if it might be worth
32 marking that either for identification or perhaps
33 as 40B-1. It's a rearranged transcript. A
34 rearrangement of 40B.

35 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. Go ahead. What number
36 are you suggesting, 40B-1 did you say?

37 MR. MCGOWAN: I think 40B-1, and let me just say the
38 rearrangement was done by Commission staff and --

39 THE COMMISSIONER: 40B-1.

40 MR. MCGOWAN: -- the times were taken from 40A.

41 There's at least one time that was typed
42 incorrectly on the new one and that's call "RIP
43 A". It says the call started at 1:32:49. I think
44 it should be 49. So the times are most accurately
45 recorded on 40A.

46 THE COMMISSIONER: Sorry, you said 1:32 what?

47 MR. MCGOWAN: It's recorded currently -- I'm looking at

Sandi Greenfield

Cross-exam by Ms. Roberts (for Government of Canada)

1 call "RIP A" on page 4 --
2 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.
3 MR. McGOWAN: -- of the new exhibit.
4 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.
5 MR. McGOWAN: And it's -- the time says that it starts,
6 on the one I just handed up at 1:32:39 --
7 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.
8 MR. McGOWAN: -- but it should be 49.
9 THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Now, any questions?

10
11 EXHIBIT 40B-1: Rearranged transcripts of
12 radio transmissions and phone calls, File
13 LM07-36874
14

15 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS. ROBERTS ON BEHALF OF THE
16 GOVERNMENT OF CANADA:
17

18 Q Ms. Greenfield, my name is Helen Roberts. I'm a
19 lawyer for the Government of Canada. I just have
20 a couple of questions for you. Would I be correct
21 in assuming that the Richmond dispatcher at E-Comm
22 dispatches to all the Richmond RCMP members and
23 not just the ones assigned to the airport
24 detachment office?

25 A That's correct.

26 Q So I think you mentioned that there were some
27 communications captured that didn't have anything
28 to do with these members or this incident.

29 A That's correct.

30 Q And they could well be members in some other part
31 of Richmond dealing with a completely different
32 matter?

33 A Yes.

34 Q All right. And I wonder if I could ask you, do
35 you have a copy of the new exhibit?

36 A Yes, I do.

37 Q Exhibit 40B-1 for the record. Could you look at
38 page 3 of that new document, "WAV FILE RIP D1 5".

39 A Yes.

40 Q And there are communications from -- about Echo-9
41 and Echo-15 and Oscar-5. Do you have any
42 information that those members with those call
43 signs were involved in the incident with Mr.
44 Dziekanski?

45 A I don't have any documentation. I don't show them
46 on the CAD event as being there, and it is
47 entirely possible that they were there.

- 1 Q All right.
- 2 A They just haven't told the dispatcher that they
3 were responding until they're there.
- 4 Q And it's equally possible they're members in some
5 other part of Richmond.
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q And if I could ask you to turn to page 6 of that
8 new exhibit, and that's the "WAV RIP D1 E". I
9 think you've already covered this off, but the
10 first four lines of that communication you said
11 wasn't connected to this incident.
- 12 A Not related. I was able to confirm that by
13 listening in on the TAC channel. Totally
14 unrelated.
- 15 Q All right. In another part of Richmond.
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Thank you. And I wanted to go through with you in
18 a little bit of detail the times of some of these
19 calls, and we now conveniently have them on
20 Exhibit 40B-1, so I'll continue with this exhibit.
21 The seventh transmission is at the bottom of page
22 3. It's "WAV FILE RIP D1 8". Do you have that?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q All right. And that's, I believe, Constable
25 Millington reporting that they have one male in
26 custody.
- 27 A Okay, we've got a transposition on the time-
28 stamping there. It's 01:31:38, not 01:13:38.
- 29 Q Oh, thank you, yes. All right. Would I be
30 correct, though, that's Constable Millington
31 reporting to dispatch that they have one male in
32 custody?
- 33 A If Millington would be Echo-2-3.
- 34 Q Yes, I think that's what you gave us on the other
35 document.
- 36 A On the CAD -- on the CAD printout. That's
37 correct.
- 38 Q And is that a typical call that an RCMP member
39 will make once somebody has been arrested and
40 handcuffed?
- 41 A Yes.
- 42 Q And that transmission ends at 1:32:02?
- 43 A Yes.
- 44 Q All right. And the next transmission is from 2-4,
45 and I understand that's Constable Bentley
46 according to your CAD printout.
- 47 A Yes.

- 1 Q And he then is asking for EHS. That's an
2 ambulance?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q All right. So he's doing that 23 seconds after
5 Constable Millington finishes his dispatch about
6 having a male in custody?
- 7 A Correct.
- 8 Q And then the next transmission is from an unknown
9 male. That's "RIP DI 1" -- or "D1 A" rather.
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And that's the one where Mr. McGowan has already
12 pointed out there's an error in the time. It
13 should be 1:32:49 for the start of the
14 transmission.
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q So that's somebody asking for an ambulance to come
17 Code 3 to the scene?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And that transmission is 20 -- 22 seconds after
20 the transmission asking for a regular ambulance?
- 21 A From the start.
- 22 Q Yes.
- 23 A It's 12 seconds from the end of that first
24 transmission.
- 25 Q I'm sorry, yes, you're right. It's 12 seconds
26 from the end of that transmission. And then the
27 next call we have is at 1:33 and that's the call
28 from Richmond dispatch to B.C. Ambulance.
- 29 A Yes.
- 30 Q Right. So I take it from this that Richmond
31 dispatch didn't have a chance in the 12 seconds to
32 call the ambulance, this was done so quickly, the
33 upgrading.
- 34 A Yes.
- 35 Q All right. And when Richmond dispatch phoned B.C.
36 Ambulance, we see from the transcript, the third
37 line where it says "Ambulance", they say:
- 38
- 39 Is this for the intoxicated guy.
- 40
- 41 A Yes.
- 42 Q All right. I haven't seen any earlier
43 transmissions from E-Comm to B.C. Ambulance. Am I
44 correct in thinking this is the first one on this
45 subject?
- 46 A To the best that I could find, yes.
- 47 Q All right. So it's apparent from this that B.C.

Sandi Greenfield

Cross-exam by Ms. Roberts (for Government of Canada)

Cross-exam by Mr. Butcher (for Constable Bentley)

1 Ambulance already knows something about an
2 intoxicated guy at the airport.

3 A That's correct.

4 Q And that transmission ends at 1:33:16 --

5 A Correct, yes.

6 Q -- from the dispatcher to the ambulance. And at
7 that very same time, the dispatcher then, without
8 hesitation, responds to Echo-24 that they've done
9 as requested, they've upgraded the call to Code 3?

10 A Yes.

11 MS. ROBERTS: Thank you. Those are all my questions.

12 THE COMMISSIONER: Anything else?

13 MR. BUTCHER: I just have a couple of questions.

14

15 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. BUTCHER ON BEHALF OF CONSTABLE
16 BILL BENTLEY:

17

18 Q The first relates to the second of the new calls
19 that you played today.

20 A Yes.

21 Q Do you remember that that was a male calling, and
22 that in the background we could hear a voice
23 saying, "Politzia, politzia"?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Can you give us again, please, the time of that
26 call?

27 THE COMMISSIONER: You're looking at 40D?

28 MR. BUTCHER: It's on Exhibit --

29 A It doesn't have a number on it. It's the small
30 little --

31 THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, 40D-1.

32 A It says 07-2174 on the top.

33 MR. BUTCHER: I'm not sure that that's something I have
34 which is --

35 THE REGISTRAR: It should be 40B-1 (sic).

36 MR. BUTCHER: Okay.

37 A So this is the start time and the stop time of the
38 second call.

39 Q So it's 1:29:03 to 1:29:35.

40 A Yes.

41 Q Thank you. Now, is the time on that document
42 synchronized with the time on the transcript that
43 we have?

44 A It should be, because they're on the same logger.

45 Q Okay. So if a transcript is made up of those
46 calls, it will be synchronized with our Exhibits
47 40B and 40E. Are you able to say that?

Sandi Greenfield

Cross-exam by Mr. Butcher (for Constable Bentley)

Cross-exam by Mr. Harris (for Corporal Robinson)

- 1 A It should be.
- 2 Q And I'm just a little confused as well about the
3 difference in the times on the CAD documents with
4 the difference on the times of the voice recorder.
- 5 A Okay.
- 6 Q The voice-recorder times are computer generated?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q The CAD times are computer generated.
- 9 A Yes. But they're on a different network.
- 10 Q Which of the two networks is connected to the
11 internet that connects with GMT?
- 12 A Well, the CAD system doesn't remain on the
13 internet. It doesn't remain open to the internet.
14 They only grab the time to synch it through that,
15 and it's for security purposes that they don't --
16 they don't have the CAD system online to the
17 internet.
- 18 Q No, I can understand that. You're not able to say
19 whether one or the other is more accurate.
- 20 A No, I'm not, but the time-stamping -- or the
21 transmission, what goes on from -- all on the --
22 on, say, the phone logger is all going to be in
23 its proper distance apart on the transmissions.
- 24 Q Yup.
- 25 A And the same with whatever is typed into the CAD
26 event. But again, you're dealing with what's
27 being said verbally and how long it takes to key
28 in and hit the transmit button.
- 29 Q Okay. Thank you.
- 30 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, thank you very much. You've
31 been very helpful. That was quite a -- oh, we
32 have some more.
- 33 MR. HARRIS: I apologize, Mr. Commissioner, I should
34 have been faster.
- 35 THE COMMISSIONER: I woke you up, I'm sorry.
- 36 MR. HARRIS: I was trying to be a gentleman to my
37 fellow counsel. Surprising to some of them,
38 though.
- 39
- 40 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. HARRIS ON BEHALF OF CORPORAL
41 BENJAMIN ROBINSON:
- 42
- 43 Q Just a couple of brief questions if I might,
44 ma'am. The document which I believe is the CAD
45 printout of this call, that's 40C, I believe if I
46 have that correctly.
- 47 A Yes.

Sandi Greenfield

Cross-exam by Mr. Harris (for Corporal Robinson)

- 1 Q All right. Now, what we know by looking at 40C
2 is, on the front page, we have information that's
3 being put into the call and it's underneath the
4 heading "Additional Remarks", correct?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q And those additional remarks that are put into the
7 call are subject to the dispatcher's discretion;
8 in other words, from their experience and
9 knowledge, they decide what they're going to type
10 into the call there and get time-stamped by
11 entering it into the call. Would that be
12 accurate?
- 13 A I believe so.
- 14 Q All right. Now, next question or set of
15 questions, over on page 2 of that document, we see
16 some officers and their unit numbers. Now, those
17 are the officers that dispatch, the dispatcher,
18 was aware were en route to the call and on scene
19 at the call, correct?
- 20 A Correct.
- 21 Q Now, there can be multiple reasons why a unit may
22 respond to the call, but not appear on the CAD
23 printout, correct?
- 24 A Correct.
- 25 Q All right. One of those reasons may be as simple
26 as there's a lot of voice chatter and it's
27 difficult to get on the air to advise radio that
28 you're en route.
- 29 A Correct.
- 30 Q All right. And if we look at your radio
31 transmissions and phone calls of what's been
32 marked as one of the exhibits here, you haven't
33 captured all the radio chatter in Richmond proper.
- 34 A No, I have not.
- 35 Q All right. So we don't know how much radio
36 communications was going on between all the
37 individual entries we have on the transcript,
38 correct?
- 39 A That's correct.
- 40 Q All right. Another reason that it may -- or let
41 me put it another way to you. An officer
42 responding to a call, they can still understand
43 what's going on at that call simply by listening
44 to the radio in their car provided it's on the
45 same channel.
- 46 A Correct.
- 47 Q All right. As well, an officer responding to a

Sandi Greenfield

Cross-exam by Mr. Harris (for Corporal Robinson)

1 call who may not be logged on can also access the
2 CAD information that appears on their screen in
3 the car while en route, even though not logged on.

4 A Logged on to their MDT?

5 Q No. They're logged on to their computer in the
6 car --

7 A Okay.

8 Q -- but they see the call come up, one of their
9 fellow units assigned. If an officer so decides,
10 they could tap into that information and monitor
11 what's coming on the screen as well.

12 A Oh, yes.

13 MR. HARRIS: All right. Thank you for answering my
14 questions.

15 THE COMMISSIONER: That seems to be it. Thank you very
16 much. That was quite a task, very appreciated.

17

18 (WITNESS EXCUSED)

19

20 MR. VERTLIEB: Now, Mr. Commissioner, the only other
21 item for discussion, then, is this issue I raised
22 with you yesterday afternoon --

23 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

24 MR. VERTLIEB: -- and that is Mr. Kosteckyj's request,
25 and Mr. Kosteckyj's provided us with a letter and
26 then a motion -- or an application. I don't think
27 you've seen this, so let me give it to you now.

28 THE COMMISSIONER: I have the letter.

29 MR. VERTLIEB: So the one thought, just at this moment,
30 going -- going as it comes, so to speak, is that
31 I'm wondering if there might be some benefit to
32 breaking now and trying to speak with the
33 different participants and their counsel on the
34 issue and see if there's any chance of coming to
35 some understanding. I would think that part of
36 the request for Taser information and training
37 materials would not be contentious. I wouldn't
38 think that's an issue.

39 What I sense is there's going to be more
40 concern around the issue of disclosure of any
41 discipline issues and things of that nature.

42 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

43 MR. VERTLIEB: So totally in your hands, but --

44 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, as --

45 MR. VERTLIEB: -- given the time, it might help.

46 THE COMMISSIONER: -- you know, I always like to see if
47 there can be cooperation on these things. How

1 long are you suggesting? Are you suggesting a
2 lunch break?

3 MR. VERTLIEB: Well, that's what I'm -- given the time
4 now, that might be helpful and then come back --

5 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, if -- unless somebody objects,
6 is 1:30 convenient?

7 MR. HARRIS: Mr. Commissioner, my difficulty is I have
8 a commitment this afternoon that I have to be at.
9 This application obviously impacts my client.

10 I've just received -- and I place no aspersions on
11 my friend for that -- just received the formal
12 notice of the application.

13 I believe I'm pretty much in agreement, but I
14 still will need to -- time to consider. I'll need
15 time to get instruction and I need time to
16 understand precisely what my friend is seeking in
17 way of documents, so I don't know if I'll be in a
18 position to provide an answer today. I certainly
19 won't be here this afternoon. I can engage in
20 discussion with my friends, but that's where I'm
21 at, at this stage.

22 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, you see, the issue here is no
23 doubt these documents are required for Monday
24 morning, and that's the issue as I perceive it.
25 So the question is how to handle that. Do you
26 take -- or are you able to take any position on
27 the -- let me just get some of this -- on the
28 training manuals?

29 MR. HARRIS: No, I take no position with that. That's
30 a reasonable request.

31 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, at least we'll get that far.

32 MR. HARRIS: As well as the Operations Manual.

33 THE COMMISSIONER: All right.

34 MR. HARRIS: The training records up to the date of the
35 incident for my client, I don't have a problem
36 with. The complete service records, I'm unclear
37 what that encaptures and what dates are being
38 looked at.

39 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. We will take that under
40 advisement. We'll take a break and come back at
41 1:30. I understand that you will not be able to
42 make that. We'll see how far we get with the rest
43 of it. I might say that I have some concerns over
44 anything that -- in the category of record that --
45 and how far it would go in the relevancy of it
46 also. I'll probably need to hear submissions and
47 probably need to think about it.

1 But obviously it can't be done in your
2 absence, but we have your position and thank you.
3 MR. HARRIS: Thank you.
4 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, does anybody think 1:30 is not
5 appropriate?
6 MR. BRONGERS: Mr. Commissioner, Jan Brongers for the
7 Government of Canada. I'm just wondering if
8 perhaps an additional half hour could be given, if
9 we could return at 2:00.
10 THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, all right, that's fine. All the
11 time in the world.
12 MR. BRONGERS: Thank you.
13 MR. KOSTECKYJ: Mr. Commissioner, I actually made other
14 arrangements, being mindful of what was said
15 yesterday, and I thought we were going to have
16 this heard first thing. But my associate, Mr.
17 Parhar, will speak to this matter at two o'clock.
18 THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, I must -- most obliged.
19 MR. KOSTECKYJ: Thank you.
20 THE COMMISSIONER: Now, while we're -- yes?
21 MR. HARRIS: Sorry, Mr. Commissioner. One thing that
22 did come up. The training -- I should have been
23 more clear, and this is the problem with getting
24 things at such short notice. I have no difficulty
25 with a record of training that my client had
26 completed at the time of the incident, but in
27 terms of records of training, I don't know if that
28 means the exams that he had written or not. Those
29 are some of the things that I put out and I wanted
30 to make sure that my acknowledgement was not
31 overly broad.
32 THE COMMISSIONER: Thank you. Another thing I want to
33 identify, and this -- as you all know, we've
34 nowhere near come near touching the medical
35 evidence, and there may be other matters in this
36 category. What I'd like to identify is this: I
37 know that under the rules there's ability at the
38 end of witnesses called by counsel for the
39 Commission, an ability to apply for the calling of
40 other witnesses.
41 Now, I want to make sure that all witnesses
42 that are to come, prior notice has been given and
43 a set list is accomplished. In other words, I
44 don't want, at the end of the witnesses that my
45 counsel calls, there's suddenly to be an
46 application for another witness, and then that
47 other witness would cause one or other of you to

1 decide on a rebuttal witness, and then we need a
2 week adjournment in order to figure out what other
3 witness is going to be and where he is, and if
4 it's a medical person from the States.

5 You can see the problem that I'm trying to
6 avoid. Accordingly, I'm just identifying now that
7 I would like to have a certain list of witnesses
8 confirmed sometime in the very near future. I
9 take it this will mainly involve counsel for
10 Taser, but I may -- there may be other issues too.
11 So I'm giving notice about that now in order that
12 we can accomplish that.

13 I hope I'm being clear on the problem I'm
14 trying to identify, because if suddenly a late-
15 calling witness comes, it could open up a series
16 of other rebuttal witnesses and then this hearing
17 will never end.

18 MR. BUTCHER: Mr. Commissioner, on that last point, it
19 would be helpful if Commission counsel could let
20 us know --

21 THE COMMISSIONER: Oh, indeed. That's part --

22 MR. BUTCHER: -- what medical evidence is going to be
23 called by the Commission because we don't have
24 that yet.

25 THE COMMISSIONER: No, I understand that. That's why
26 I'm identifying it for everybody.

27 MR. BUTCHER: Or not just medical experts, but other
28 experts such as a use-of-force expert. Those --
29 that's frankly the kind of expert that counsel for
30 the officers may be interested in calling.

31 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes. Yes.

32 MR. BUTCHER: So --

33 THE COMMISSIONER: We appreciate that.

34 MR. BUTCHER: Thank you.

35 MS. SPENCER: Jennifer Spencer for TASER. Mr.
36 Commissioner, you'll recall our application at the
37 beginning --

38 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, I do.

39 MS. SPENCER: -- and that's still pending, from what I
40 understand.

41 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes, that's right.

42 MR. SPENCER: So I wonder are you making a more
43 specific direction about when this more complete
44 list could be finalized or is --

45 THE COMMISSIONER: No, no, no.

46 MS. SPENCER: -- it a suggestion?

47 THE COMMISSIONER: I'm just identifying a problem so

1 that everyone can think about it. And then if
2 need be in the very near future, if some kind of
3 an agreement or arrangement has not been reached,
4 I will be making very definite orders. But I
5 don't just want to do that without an attempt at
6 full cooperation. Two o'clock.

7 MS. SPENCER: Thank you.

8 THE REGISTRAR: This hearing is now adjourned until
9 2:00 p.m.

10
11 (PROCEEDINGS ADJOURNED FOR NOON RECESS)

12 (PROCEEDINGS RECONVENED)

13
14 THE REGISTRAR: The hearing is now resumed.

15 MR. VERTLIEB: Thank you, Mr. Commissioner. You'll be
16 pleased to know that all of your lawyers met at
17 the lunch break and spent considerable time, and
18 we've come a long way to resolving this motion
19 filed on behalf of Mrs. Cisowski. So I'm trusting
20 you have the motion in front of you?

21 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

22 MR. VERTLIEB: And all lawyers for all participants
23 agree to question -- or to point number 1 and
24 point number 2.

25 THE COMMISSIONER: All right. I make that order.

26 MR. VERTLIEB: Now, as to number 3, we've really, in
27 our discussions, broken this down into two
28 subparagraphs, and we have agreement from all
29 lawyers, and Department of Justice is seeking
30 instructions to agree, and they're not able to
31 agree yet and they hope to have instructions
32 tomorrow. They've -- the Department of Justice
33 counsel, Ms. Roberts and Mr. Brongers, have asked
34 that on that basis we technically adjourn this
35 request to Monday --

36 THE COMMISSIONER: Yes.

37 MR. VERTLIEB: -- in the hopes that it can be resolved.

38 But let me tell you what it would look like
39 if we get the agreement that we anticipate getting
40 from all parties. What we really would be doing
41 is having 3(a), which would state regarding
42 individual RCMP member discipline records, the
43 records of substantiated complaints and code of
44 conduct records, civil or criminal, until the date
45 of the incident, regarding three items, Mr.
46 Commissioner: a) use of force, b) unlawful
47 arrest, and c) care of prisoners. We can give you

1 this wording.

2 THE COMMISSIONER: That sounds very reasonable.

3 MR. VERTLIEB: And the second part of 3, which we are
4 calling 3(b), would be assurances through counsel
5 for Department of Justice that all members passing
6 the course in Regina, referred to as Depot, and
7 then the subsequent field training, would have
8 successfully completed all requirements.

9 To explain only to you what we're -- the
10 concern was could someone be graduated from Depot
11 and certified for field training and still not
12 have successfully passed every course. The sub
13 part of this same assurance would be, as I just
14 said to you, that every member successfully
15 completing (sic) the course.

16 And then finally to say to you, Mr.
17 Commissioner, all of this was done with the
18 understanding that Mr. Kosteckyj, who brought this
19 motion, and Ms. Pastine, who had a similar concern
20 in an e-mail format, not from a motion, are at
21 liberty to re-apply should they have more concerns
22 as these documents are produced, and we think
23 that's eminently reasonable.

24 Now, I just wanted to tell you that that's --
25 I'm hoping that we'll have Department of Justice
26 agreement tomorrow, and the only other comment is
27 Ms. Roberts is concerned about the timing of
28 production of some of these documents, and we've
29 explained to her we don't want her to make any
30 commitment that she personally cannot meet. She's
31 assured us that she will use her best efforts to
32 get this material as quickly as possible, and we,
33 as counsel, accept that and are grateful for it.

34 But the problem, I say to you, is just that
35 we don't know a date for delivery of some of this,
36 but I trust Ms. Roberts, and she will do it as
37 quickly as all possible efforts will allow.

38 Now, just give me one second to make sure
39 I've covered this. So I think we've covered it
40 all and my colleagues are free to disagree at any
41 part, but I do have confidence that we've agreed,
42 and truly, Mr. Commissioner, all these lawyers
43 have been at your service to come to agreement to
44 save a couple of days of potential dispute.

45 THE COMMISSIONER: Is there any comment on any of this?
46 Well, obviously I'm very pleased that this is able
47 to be accomplished as described.

1 MR. PARHAR: Mr. Commissioner, the only thing I didn't
2 hear and I wanted to just clarify was on 3. I
3 know it's not agreed to yet, but -- and in
4 addition to code of conduct complaints, also it's
5 public complaints as well. I wasn't sure if I
6 just missed that or if it was -- thank you.

7 MR. VERTLIEB: Yes, that is -- I believe I said that
8 and it's part of our written memo that confirms
9 it. So code of conduct and public.

10 THE COMMISSIONER: But substantiated.

11 MR. VERTLIEB: Yes. Records of substantiated, yes, not
12 just complaints.

13 THE COMMISSIONER: 'Cause there's very few, for
14 example, in our profession, that have not had some
15 complaint. We only want substantiated complaints.

16 MR. VERTLIEB: Yes, you're correct.

17 THE COMMISSIONER: Well, obviously that is a very
18 sensible conclusion to this matter, and I'm very
19 much in the debt of all counsel for this effort.

20 All right. Then the motion in the second
21 part as described by counsel is adjourned until
22 ten o'clock on Monday, and these proceedings are
23 adjourned until ten o'clock on Monday.

24 THE REGISTRAR: This hearing is now adjourned until
25 10:00 a.m. on Monday.

26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

(PROCEEDINGS ADJOURNED TO FEBRUARY 23, 2009
AT 10:00 A.M.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47